# Obscuro: A Bitcoin Mixer using Trusted Execution Environments

*Muoi Tran*, Loi Luu, Min Suk Kang, Iddo Bentov, and Prateek Saxena ACSAC 2018 | December 3–7 | San Juan, Puerto Rico, USA









2









































#### Multiple senders submit *denomination* coins to their *randomly shuffled* recipients





Multiple senders submit *denomination* coins to their *randomly shuffled* recipients





Multiple senders submit *denomination* coins to their *randomly shuffled* recipients





- Multiple senders submit *denomination* coins to their *randomly shuffled* recipients
- Difficult to identify sender of a given recipient:





- Multiple senders submit *denomination* coins to their *randomly shuffled* recipients
- Difficult to identify sender of a given recipient:





- Multiple senders submit *denomination* coins to their *randomly shuffled* recipients
- Difficult to identify sender of a given recipient:

Probability = 1/{# users in a mix}



3



- Multiple senders submit *denomination* coins to their *randomly shuffled* recipients
- Difficult to identify sender of a given recipient:

Probability = 1/{# users in a mix}

Security parameter:

Anonymity set size, or the number of users per mixing round



4









Centralized mixer

• Simple architecture, large anonymity set size (e.g., thousands)





- Simple architecture, large anonymity set size (e.g., thousands)
- Mixer operator may *misbehave*





- Simple architecture, large anonymity set size (e.g., thousands)
- Mixer operator may *misbehave* 
  - ✓ Steal coin or leak permutation





- Simple architecture, large anonymity set size (e.g., thousands)
- Mixer operator may *misbehave* 
  - ✓ Steal coin or leak permutation
  - ✓ Partial solutions exist (e.g., TumbleBit [NDSS'17])





- Simple architecture, large anonymity set size (e.g., thousands)
- Mixer operator may *misbehave* 
  - ✓ Steal coin or leak permutation
  - ✓ Partial solutions exist (e.g., TumbleBit [NDSS'17])







Centralized mixer

- Simple architecture, large anonymity set size (e.g., thousands)
- Mixer operator may *misbehave* 
  - Steal coin or leak permutation
  - ✓ Partial solutions exist (e.g., TumbleBit [NDSS'17])



Not rely on any centralized party





- Simple architecture, large anonymity set size (e.g., thousands)
- Mixer operator may *misbehave* 
  - Steal coin or leak permutation
  - ✓ Partial solutions exist (e.g., TumbleBit [NDSS'17])



- Not rely on any centralized party
- *High* communication overhead





- Simple architecture, large anonymity set size (e.g., thousands)
- Mixer operator may *misbehave* 
  - ✓ Steal coin or leak permutation
  - ✓ Partial solutions exist (e.g., TumbleBit [NDSS'17])



- Not rely on any centralized party
- High communication overhead
  - ✓ E.g., 100 users may take 21s to mins (or even longer) to mix using CoinShuffle++ [NDSS'17]



Centralized mixer

- Simple architecture, large anonymity set size (e.g., thousands)
- Mixer operator may *misbehave* 
  - ✓ Steal coin or leak permutation
  - ✓ Partial solutions exist (e.g., TumbleBit [NDSS'17])

De-centralized mixer

- Not rely on any centralized party
- *High* communication overhead
  - ✓ E.g., 100 users may take 21s to mins (or even longer) to mix using CoinShuffle++ [NDSS'17]







• Trusted Execution Environments (TEEs)





Trusted Execution Environments (TEEs)

5





Trusted Execution Environments (TEEs)

Trusted software

5







Verifier	•	Trusted Execution Environments (TEEs)
Evil operator or Compromised OS Malicious mixer OS		
Trusted software		
Untrusted server		


	<b>O</b> Verifier	
Ev	vil operator or Compromised C	s,
	Malicious mixer OS	
(	Ē	
	Trusted software	
	SGX Enclave	
	Untrusted ser	ver

- Trusted Execution Environments (TEEs)
  - confidentiality and integrity of code and data in a protected memory region, called an enclave



<b>O</b> Verifier					
Evi	l operator or Compromised	IOS			
	Malicious mixer OS				
ſ					
	Trusted software				
	SGX Enclave				
	Untrusted s	erver			

- Trusted Execution Environments (TEEs)
  - confidentiality and integrity of code and data in a protected memory region, called an enclave



ſ	attest Verifier							
	Evil operator or Compromised OS							
	[	Malicious mixer OS						
	ſ	×	<b>D</b>					
l	<b>→</b>	Trusted software						
		SGX Enclave						
		Untrusted s	erver					

- Trusted Execution Environments (TEEs)
  - confidentiality and integrity of code and data in a protected memory region, called an enclave
  - ✓ verifiable via *remote attestation*



	User				
attes	st				
Evil operator or Compromised OS					
	Malicious m				
(					
	Mixing permutation	Bitcoin keys			
	SGX Enclave				
Mixe	r platform				

- Trusted Execution Environments (TEEs)
  - confidentiality and integrity of code and data in a protected memory region, called an enclave
  - ✓ verifiable via *remote attestation*
- TEE-based mixer addresses simple attacks





#### Trusted Execution Environments (TEEs)

- confidentiality and integrity of code and data in a protected memory region, called an enclave
- ✓ verifiable via *remote attestation*
- TEE-based mixer addresses simple attacks
  - ✓ malicious mixer OS cannot steal coins or leak the mixing permutation





- Trusted Execution Environments (TEEs)
  - confidentiality and integrity of code and data in a protected memory region, called an enclave
  - ✓ verifiable via *remote attestation*
- TEE-based mixer addresses simple attacks
  - ✓ malicious mixer OS cannot steal coins or leak the mixing permutation
  - ✓ users verify Obscuro's execution before they join





- Trusted Execution Environments (TEEs)
  - ✓ confidentiality and integrity of code and

Is this Naïve TEE-based mixer design *sufficient?* 

- TEE-based mixer addresses simple attacks
  - ✓ malicious mixer OS cannot steal coins or leak the mixing permutation
  - users verify Obscuro's execution before they join







#### Adversary model



#### Adversary model

Capabilities:



#### Adversary model

- Capabilities:
  - Mixer OS can read/write all messages



#### Adversary model

- Capabilities:
  - Mixer OS can read/write all messages
  - ✓ Mixer OS can create Bitcoin blocks and transactions



# Adversary modelCapabilities:

- Mixer OS can read/write all messages
- ✓ Mixer OS can create Bitcoin blocks and transactions
- Goal: reduce anonymity set





#### Naïve Obscuro Model

#### Adversary model

- Capabilities:
  - Mixer OS can read/write all messages
  - ✓ Mixer OS can create Bitcoin blocks and transactions
- Goal: reduce anonymity set

Two specific attacks:(1) Participation rejection(2) Blockchain forking







Naïve Obscuro







 Malicious mixer OS *rejects* some benign users:







- Malicious mixer OS *rejects* some benign users:
  - ✓ Users cannot inform Obscuro their recipients





- Malicious mixer OS *rejects* some benign users:
  - ✓ Users cannot inform Obscuro their recipients
- Instead, adversary inserts her own participants





- Malicious mixer OS *rejects* some benign users:
  - Users cannot inform Obscuro their recipients
- Instead, adversary inserts her own participants





- Malicious mixer OS *rejects* some benign users:
  - ✓ Users cannot inform Obscuro their recipients
- Instead, adversary inserts her own participants
- Benign users may see a large anonymity set but small anonymity set in practice





- Malicious mixer OS *rejects* some benign users:
  - Users cannot inform Obscuro their recipients
- Instead, adversary inserts her own participants
- Benign users may see a large anonymity set but small anonymity set in practice





- Malicious mixer OS *rejects* some benign users:
  - Users cannot inform Obscuro their recipients
  - Instead, adversary inserts her own participants
- Benign users may see a large anonymity set but small anonymity set in practice















• Users *never* contact the mixer







- Users *never* contact the mixer
- But submit transactions to the blockchain to participate mixing:







- Users *never* contact the mixer
- But submit transactions to the blockchain to participate mixing:
  - Recipient address is *encrypted* via ECIES<sup>\*</sup> (a *69-byte* encryption)







- Users *never* contact the mixer
- But submit transactions to the blockchain to participate mixing:
  - Recipient address is *encrypted* via ECIES<sup>\*</sup> (a *69-byte* encryption)
- Obscuro searches user deposits from the blockchain





- Users *never* contact the mixer
- But submit transactions to the blockchain to participate mixing:
  - Recipient address is *encrypted* via ECIES<sup>\*</sup> (a *69-byte* encryption)
- Obscuro searches user deposits from the blockchain





- Users *never* contact the mixer
- But submit transactions to the blockchain to participate mixing:
  - Recipient address is *encrypted* via ECIES<sup>\*</sup> (a *69-byte* encryption)
- Obscuro searches user deposits from the blockchain





Reducing anonymity set even when Obscuro deploys indirect participation



Reducing anonymity set even when Obscuro deploys indirect participation



Users deposits



Reducing anonymity set even when Obscuro deploys indirect participation



 Mixer OS creates *another mixing set* ✓ including some targeted transactions and her transactions



Reducing anonymity set even when Obscuro deploys indirect participation



- Mixer OS creates another mixing set
  - ✓ including some targeted transactions and her transactions
- Adversarial set is fed to Obscuro



Reducing anonymity set even when Obscuro deploys indirect participation



- Mixer OS creates *another mixing set* 
  - including some targeted transactions and her transactions
- Adversarial set is fed to Obscuro
  - ✓ the targeted recipient is *identified*
# Attack 2: Blockchain Forking



Reducing anonymity set even when Obscuro deploys indirect participation



- Mixer OS creates another mixing set
  - ✓ including some targeted transactions and her transactions
- Adversarial set is fed to Obscuro
  - ✓ the targeted recipient is *identified*
- Valid users set is fed to Obscuro

# Attack 2: Blockchain Forking



Reducing anonymity set even when Obscuro deploys indirect participation



- Mixer OS creates another mixing set
  - including some targeted transactions and her transactions
- Adversarial set is fed to Obscuro
  - ✓ the targeted recipient is *identified*
- Valid users set is fed to Obscuro
  - ✓ the targeted recipient is *already* identified

# Attack 2: Blockchain Forking



Reducing anonymity set even when Obscuro deploys indirect participation



- Mixer OS creates another mixing set
  - ✓ including some targeted transactions and her transactions
- How to enforce naïve Obscuro to mix a transaction twice?
- Valid users set is fed to Obscuro
  - ✓ the targeted recipient is *already* identified



Malicious mixer OS

Naïve Obscuro





Malicious mixer OS

Naïve Obscuro

Blockchain view of naïve Obscuro



 Malicious OS *manipulates* the *blockchain view* of the naïve Obscuro:





 Malicious OS *manipulates* the *blockchain view* of the naïve Obscuro:





- Malicious OS *manipulates* the *blockchain view* of the naïve Obscuro:
  - ✓ adversary first feeds a block includes targeted transactions and her transactions





- Malicious OS *manipulates* the ٠ blockchain view of the naïve Obscuro:
  - ✓ adversary first feeds a block includes targeted transactions and her transactions



- Malicious OS *manipulates* the ٠ blockchain view of the naïve Obscuro:
  - ✓ adversary first feeds a block includes targeted transactions and her transactions





- Malicious OS *manipulates* the *blockchain view* of the naïve Obscuro:
  - ✓ adversary first feeds a block includes targeted transactions and her transactions



- NUS National University of Singapore
- Malicious OS *manipulates* the *blockchain view* of the naïve Obscuro:
  - adversary first feeds a block includes targeted transactions and her transactions









- Malicious OS *manipulates* the *blockchain view* of the naïve Obscuro:
  - adversary first feeds a block includes targeted transactions and her transactions





- Malicious OS *manipulates* the *blockchain view* of the naïve Obscuro:
  - ✓ adversary first feeds a block includes targeted transactions and her transactions
  - ✓ adversary then feeds the valid blockchain





- Malicious OS *manipulates* the *blockchain view* of the naïve Obscuro:
  - ✓ adversary first feeds a block includes targeted transactions and her transactions
  - adversary then feeds the valid blockchain
  - ✓ adversarial chain becomes
    *orphaned* and is *abandoned*





- Malicious OS *manipulates* the *blockchain view* of the naïve Obscuro:
  - ✓ adversary first feeds a block includes targeted transactions and her transactions
  - adversary then feeds the valid blockchain
  - ✓ adversarial chain becomes
    *orphaned* and is *abandoned*





- Malicious OS *manipulates* the *blockchain view* of the naïve Obscuro:
  - adversary first feeds a block includes targeted transactions and her transactions
  - adversary then feeds the valid blockchain
  - ✓ adversarial chain becomes
    *orphaned* and is *abandoned*





- Malicious OS *manipulates* the *blockchain view* of the naïve Obscuro:
  - adversary first feeds a block includes targeted transactions and her transactions
  - adversary then feeds the valid blockchain
  - ✓ adversarial chain becomes
    *orphaned* and is *abandoned*
- Attack is *invisible*





- Malicious OS *manipulates* the *blockchain view* of the naïve Obscuro:
  - ✓ adversary first feeds a block includes targeted transactions and

Effective against *all* existing centralized mixers!

- ✓ adversarial chain becomes
  *orphaned* and is *abandoned*
- Attack is *invisible*





 Obscuro detects if blockchain feed contains two chains and a transaction is already mixed



- Obscuro detects if blockchain feed contains two chains and a transaction is already mixed
- Obscuro *excludes* the repeated transaction and guarantees each transaction can be mixed at most once



- Obscuro detects if blockchain feed contains two chains and a transaction is already mixed
- Obscuro *excludes* the repeated transaction and guarantees each transaction can be mixed at most once
  - ✓ Excluded transactions are refunded





#### Anonymity set size reduction attacks (Attack 1 & 2)



Anonymity set size reduction attacks (Attack 1 & 2)

• Require attack capabilities:



Anonymity set size reduction attacks (Attack 1 & 2)

- Require attack capabilities:
  - ✓ Rejecting user participations

✓ Mixing twice with different anonymity set size



Anonymity set size reduction attacks (Attack 1 & 2)

• Require attack capabilities:

Rejecting user participations removed

No direct deposits (via indirect participation)

✓ Mixing twice with different anonymity set size



Anonymity set size reduction attacks (Attack 1 & 2)

• Require attack capabilities:

Rejecting user participations removed

No direct deposits (via indirect participation)

✓ Mixing twice with different anonymity set size removed

No malicious forking



Anonymity set size reduction attacks (Attack 1 & 2)

• Require attack capabilities:

Rejecting user participations removed

No direct deposits (via indirect participation)

✓ Mixing twice with different anonymity set size removed

No malicious forking

More (informal) security analysis can be found in our paper





• Obscuro's existing Trusted Computing Base (TCB)



- Obscuro's existing Trusted Computing Base (TCB)
  - ✓ Bitcoin core v0.13.1



- Obscuro's existing Trusted Computing Base (TCB)
  - ✓ Bitcoin core v0.13.1
  - ✓ OpenSSL, libsecp256k1



- Obscuro's existing Trusted Computing Base (TCB)
  - ✓ Bitcoin core v0.13.1
  - ✓ OpenSSL, libsecp256k1
  - ✓ Panoply [NDSS' 17] abstraction framework



- Obscuro's existing Trusted Computing Base (TCB)
  - ✓ Bitcoin core v0.13.1
  - ✓ OpenSSL, libsecp256k1
  - ✓ Panoply [NDSS' 17] abstraction framework
- Obscuro contributes only 2,442 SLoC in addition to TCB
#### Implementation



- Obscuro's existing Trusted Computing Base (TCB)
  - ✓ Bitcoin core v0.13.1
  - ✓ OpenSSL, libsecp256k1
  - ✓ Panoply [NDSS' 17] abstraction framework
- Obscuro contributes only 2,442 SLoC in addition to TCB

Obscuro's functions	1,150 SLoC	Additional
Bitcoin core modification	1,292 SLoC	ТСВ



14



Experiment setup



#### Experiment setup



CPU: Intel Core i7-6820HQ RAM: 8GB Ubuntu 16.04 LTS

Intel SGX SDK for Linux



#### Experiment setup



Computation time (mixing, signing) of Obscuro



#### Experiment setup



Computation time (mixing, signing) of Obscuro



#### Experiment setup



Computation time (mixing, signing) of Obscuro

E.g., TumbleBit [NDSS' 17] computation time for one pair of sender-recipient is 0.6s

#### NUS National University of Singapore

#### Experiment setup





	Bitcoin Mixers
	Obscuro



	Bitcoin Mixers
	Coinshuffle++ [NDSS'17]
Decentralized	CoinParty [CODASPY'15]
	Xim [WPES'13]
	Obscuro



	Bitcoin Mixers
	Coinshuffle++ [NDSS'17]
Decentralized	CoinParty [CODASPY'15]
	Xim [WPES'13]
Centralized	Blindcoin [FC'15]
	TumbleBit [NDSS'17]
	Obscuro



	Bitcoin Mixers	Theft prevention
	Coinshuffle++ [NDSS'17]	
Decentralized	CoinParty [CODASPY'15]	
	Xim [WPES'13]	
	Blindcoin [FC'15]	
Centralized	TumbleBit [NDSS'17]	
	Obscuro	



	Bitcoin Mixers	Theft prevention	Participation guarantee	
Decentralized -	Coinshuffle++ [NDSS'17]			
	CoinParty [CODASPY'15]			
-	Xim [WPES'13]			
	Blindcoin [FC'15]			
Centralized	TumbleBit [NDSS'17]			
	Obscuro			



	Bitcoin Mixers	Theft prevention	Participation guarantee	
Decentralized -	Coinshuffle++ [NDSS'17]	~	$\checkmark$	
	CoinParty [CODASPY'15]	~	×	
-	Xim [WPES'13]	~	×	
Centralized	Blindcoin [FC'15]			
	TumbleBit [NDSS'17]	<ul> <li></li> </ul>		
	Obscuro	<b>V</b>	$\checkmark$	



	Bitcoin Mixers	Theft prevention	Participation guarantee	Large mixing set guarantee
Decentralized	Coinshuffle++ [NDSS'17]	<ul> <li></li> </ul>	<ul> <li></li> </ul>	
	CoinParty [CODASPY'15]	~	×	
-	Xim [WPES'13]	~	$\checkmark$	
Centralized	Blindcoin [FC'15]			
	TumbleBit [NDSS'17]	~		
	Obscuro	<b>V</b>	$\checkmark$	



	Bitcoin Mixers	Theft prevention	Participation guarantee	Large mixing set guarantee	Join-then-abort resistance
Decentralized	Coinshuffle++ [NDSS'17]	~	$\checkmark$		
	CoinParty [CODASPY'15]	~	×		
-	Xim [WPES'13]	~	$\checkmark$		
Centralized	Blindcoin [FC'15]				
	TumbleBit [NDSS'17]	$\checkmark$			
	Obscuro	<b>V</b>	$\checkmark$		



	Bitcoin Mixers	Theft prevention	Participation guarantee	Large mixing set guarantee	Join-then-abort resistance
Decentralized	Coinshuffle++ [NDSS'17]	<ul> <li></li> </ul>	$\sim$		
	CoinParty [CODASPY'15]	~	×	<ul> <li></li> </ul>	
	Xim [WPES'13]	~	$\checkmark$		<ul> <li></li> </ul>
Centralized	Blindcoin [FC'15]				<ul> <li></li> </ul>
	TumbleBit [NDSS'17]	~			<ul> <li></li> </ul>
	Obscuro	$\checkmark$	<ul> <li></li> </ul>	$\checkmark$	<ul> <li></li> </ul>



	Bitcoin Mixers	Theft prevention	Participation guarantee	Large mixing set guarantee	Join-then-abort resistance
Decentralized	Coinshuffle++ [NDSS'17]	×	$\checkmark$		
	CoinParty [CODASPY'15]	~	~		
-	Xim [WPES'13]	~	$\checkmark$		<ul> <li></li> </ul>
Centralized	Blindcoin [FC'15]				
	TumbleBit [NDSS'17]	~			$\checkmark$
	Obscuro	$\checkmark$	<ul> <li></li> </ul>	$\checkmark$	<ul> <li></li> </ul>

**Obscuro's limitations:** 



	Bitcoin Mixers	Theft prevention	Participation guarantee	Large mixing set guarantee	Join-then-abort resistance
Decentralized	Coinshuffle++ [NDSS'17]	<ul> <li></li> </ul>	$\checkmark$		
	CoinParty [CODASPY'15]	~	×	<ul> <li></li> </ul>	
-	Xim [WPES'13]	~	$\checkmark$		<ul> <li></li> </ul>
Centralized	Blindcoin [FC'15]				<ul> <li></li> </ul>
	TumbleBit [NDSS'17]	$\checkmark$			$\checkmark$
	Obscuro	$\checkmark$	<ul> <li></li> </ul>	$\checkmark$	<ul> <li></li> </ul>

#### **Obscuro's limitations:**

 Reliance on Intel SGX → deployed with other trusted-hardware (e.g., ARM TrustZone, OP-TEE)



	Bitcoin Mixers	Theft prevention	Participation guarantee	Large mixing set guarantee	Join-then-abort resistance
Decentralized	Coinshuffle++ [NDSS'17]	<ul> <li></li> </ul>	$\checkmark$		
	CoinParty [CODASPY'15]	~	×	<ul> <li>Image: A set of the set of the</li></ul>	
	Xim [WPES'13]	~	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$
Centralized	Blindcoin [FC'15]				<ul> <li></li> </ul>
	TumbleBit [NDSS'17]	~			<ul> <li></li> </ul>
	Obscuro	<ul> <li></li> </ul>	<ul> <li></li> </ul>	$\checkmark$	<ul> <li></li> </ul>

#### **Obscuro's limitations:**

- Reliance on Intel SGX → deployed with other trusted-hardware (e.g., ARM TrustZone, OP-TEE)
- Vulnerable to side-channel attacks → defenses are orthogonal with Obscuro





- Obscuro Bitcoin mixer is *efficient* 
  - ✓ maintains the simple centralized architecture to achieve high performance (e.g., mix thousand in seconds).



- Obscuro Bitcoin mixer is *efficient* 
  - ✓ maintains the simple centralized architecture to achieve high performance (e.g., mix thousand in seconds).
- Obscuro Bitcoin mixer is secure
  - ✓ prevents a malicious operator from misbehaving using TEEs.
  - ✓ guarantees any user can join the mix, and get refunded if the mix is unsuccessful.



- Obscuro Bitcoin mixer is *efficient* 
  - ✓ maintains the simple centralized architecture to achieve high performance (e.g., mix thousand in seconds).
- Obscuro Bitcoin mixer is secure
  - ✓ prevents a malicious operator from misbehaving using TEEs.
  - ✓ guarantees any user can join the mix, and get refunded if the mix is unsuccessful.
- Obscuro is available today

 ✓ Obscuro is implemented with Intel SGX and available at: <u>https://github.com/BitObscuro/Obscuro</u>



# **Question?**

#### Muoi Tran muoitran@comp.nus.edu.sg